

WARD v. WILBANKS, ET AL

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Prepared for you by



Bingham Farms | Ann Arbor | Detroit | Flint | Grand Rapids | Jackson | Lansing | Mt. Clemens

PHONE: 248.644.8888 FAX: 248.644.1120

www.bienenstock.com

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 1

IN THE DISTRICT COURT OF THE UNITED STATES

FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN

SOUTHERN DIVISION

JULEA WARD,

Plaintiff,

vs.

Case No. 2:09-cv-11237-GCS-PJK

Hon. George Caram Steeh

ROY WILBANKS, et al.,

Defendants.

The Deposition of PERRY CLARK FRANCIS,

Taken at 101 North Main Street, Seventh Floor

Ann Arbor, Michigan,

Commencing at 2:17 p.m.,

Thursday, December 17, 2009,

Before Leisa M. Pastor, CSR-3500, RPR, CRR.

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 37

1 situations where, perhaps, concerns were raised, but
2 they weren't sufficient enough to warrant an informal
3 review process?

4 A. That would be correct.

5 Q. So, with those students, they would still be approved
6 for practicum?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Or would someone just be outwardly denied?

9 A. Let's say professor A brings up a concern about
10 student Z, Professor B, C, and D say we have not seen
11 this behavior, or it's by been my experience this
12 student has demonstrated these skills very well in
13 this particular course. That may satisfy Professor A
14 that what they were seeing did not rise to the level
15 to deny a student admission into practicum.

16 Q. Is a student ever denied for practicum without going
17 to an informal review conference?

18 A. A student, if they're denied for practicum,
19 immediately go to an informal review.

20 Q. How many clients, on average, do you get each -- each
21 semester at the counseling clinic?

22 A. In the fall, and winter, if we have 15, a full
23 contingent of 15 clinicians, or clinicians in
24 training, each clinician will start the first week
25 with one, and then continue on and then build up. So,

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 38

1 I couldn't give you an accurate number, because they
2 come and go, and sometimes a client might stay for the
3 full 15 weeks and sometimes not. It's not a number
4 that I regularly look at.

5 Q. Can you give me an estimate, based on your experience
6 running the clinic?

7 A. I can give you a range.

8 Q. Sure, that'd be fine.

9 A. Anywhere from 75 to 125.

10 Q. And that's for each semester?

11 A. That would be fall and winter. In the spring/summer,
12 when we only have five or six clinicians, you figure
13 five clients per clinician, and then some rotating in
14 and out, you could have a range of anywhere from 25 to
15 45.

16 Q. So you limit the number of clients that you see, based
17 on the clinicians that you have available?

18 A. Correct.

19 Q. Has there ever been a situation where a client has
20 needed to continue counseling past a given semester?

21 A. That is correct, yes.

22 Q. That's occurred?

23 A. Mm-hmm.

24 Q. What do you do? My -- what do you do with a client,
25 in that circumstance? Do you -- is the -- does this

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 39

1 -- does the student who's been seeing that client
2 continue to see that client, or do you transfer that
3 client to somebody else, to accommodate them in some
4 other way?

5 A. In a particular case, if counselor A sees a client,
6 let's say, for five sessions, and the semester comes
7 to a close, especially towards the end of a semester,
8 we inform all clients you're coming to the close of a
9 semester, you might just see this clinician five
10 times. If the client agrees and understands that,
11 then the client moves forward. They see the counselor
12 five times. At the end of that, they do a termination
13 session where, in most cases, the
14 counselor-in-training and the client talk about what
15 gains have been made, what other things could they
16 work on, what goals have been met, what goals haven't
17 been met, and then they say, "Would you like to
18 continue on counseling next semester with a new
19 clinician?"

20 The client then has the ability to say yes,
21 no, or maybe. We have an active, pending, and, you
22 know, closed case. The client is then put on the list
23 for the next semester. When the next semester gets
24 started, they are first in the rotation to receive a
25 counselor-in-training, and begin the process over

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 40

1 again. We want to ensure that the client is given the
2 opportunity, the autonomy to say yes, no, or maybe --
3 it's their decision -- as well as review with them
4 what progress they've made and what goals they might
5 want to additionally seek in the future.

6 Q. How often each semester would you say clients are
7 carrying over and switching from one student to a
8 different student in the --

9 A. I really don't know, I don't keep track of that.

10 Q. Does -- in your experience, does it happen a lot, a
11 little?

12 A. I can't give you a number, because I don't know. I do
13 know that it does happen.

14 Q. Okay. Do you have any supervisory responsibilities
15 over the students who are in -- actually engaging in
16 the counseling, or is that supervisory role satisfied
17 solely by whoever the supervising professor is for
18 that particular standpoint?

19 A. Supervision comes in two forms, administrative
20 supervision and clinical supervision. Now nothing's
21 ever quite that, you know, clean or dichotomous. My
22 job, as the administrator of the clinic, is to provide
23 administrative supervision. So I manage the process
24 of, you know, clients coming in, making sure that the
25 clinic's running smoothly, answering questions to

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 41

1 clients, to counselors-in-training about particular
2 processes, keeping files where the files are kept, and
3 such.

4 When I offer clinical supervision, it's
5 usually because the clinical faculty member, the
6 supervising faculty member is either not available or
7 it's an emergency situation. So I may get called in
8 in the cases I have in the past, when a client
9 demonstrates, say, suicidal ideation or talks about
10 child abuse. And it may be during the day before
11 their faculty supervisor has arrived, or isn't in that
12 day. In that particular case, I would provide
13 clinical supervision, or I would intervene directly,
14 ensuring the safety of the client, because the
15 client's safety and needs are paramount for us.

16 Q. Is the -- is the primary responsibility for providing
17 supervision for the students enrolled in practicum
18 with the supervising faculty that are overseeing that
19 student's practicum course?

20 A. Primary clinical supervision is provided by the
21 faculty supervisor, who has the responsibility for
22 that particular pod of students.

23 Q. When a client comes to the clinic, first visit--

24 A. Mm-hmm.

25 Q. -- prior -- yeah, first visit, and says they want to

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 42

1 engage the clinic's counseling services, walk me
2 through the process, what happens with that particular
3 person?

4 A. Generally someone would call, either because of
5 referral from various sources, or because they have
6 found us through various referral sources, call the
7 clinic, the secretary, my GA, or I would take the call
8 and gather particular information. Name, address,
9 phone number, e-mail, and generally what's the
10 presenting issue. I try my best to screen out those
11 clients who are presenting with issues that are beyond
12 the skill level of the clinicians that we have. In
13 other words, we have beginning level clinicians; so,
14 I'm not going to take someone who's actively suicidal,
15 that would be inappropriate, and then I would make a
16 referral to someone outside, you know, give them three
17 or four names or other resources where they could find
18 services. The paper, the initial client contact form
19 would be given, then, to my GA, who handles the
20 appointment book. She would then contact that
21 particular client, and find an appropriate time for
22 them to meet with our clinician, and depending upon
23 the availability of the clinician.

24 Q. Who is the GA that you -- that oversees the assigning
25 of the clients?

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 43

1 A. During Julea Ward's time, it was Shannon Thayer.

2 Q. Is that a rotating position that students fill from
3 time to time, or is there -- is it a permanent
4 position?

5 A. Well, "permanent" in any university setting is
6 nebulous, at best, when it comes to students. It is a
7 GA graduate assistant position. So, GAs are assigned.
8 My GA, or the GA that works basically for me at the
9 clinic, I generally try and keep for two to two and a
10 half to three years. So, throughout the duration of
11 their education.

12 Q. What's your role in the actual assignment of a
13 prospective client to a student counselor? What do
14 you do in that process?

15 A. I hand it to my GA, who has made it -- in this
16 particular case, Shannon Thayer. And, you know, now
17 Shannon's not there, Shannon's graduated, but in
18 Shannon's case, she would often tell me to stay out of
19 the appointment book, because I'd screw things up.

20 Q. So, did she have autonomy to assign clients to student
21 counselors as she saw fit, as far as the scheduling
22 availability went?

23 A. She had limited autonomy, in the sense that what I
24 would do is hand her the initial contact form; she
25 would match up times to clients, to counselors and

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 44

1 then contact the prospective client and offer whatever
2 times that we had.

3 Q. Would you approve the client assignment, or would that
4 be something that she would just handle on her own?

5 A. There's no approval or disapproval. It's, here's the
6 client, here's the time, here's the clinician, do it.
7 There are particular times where, if a particular
8 client, per se, is a child, and we have certain
9 clinicians who want to have experience with children,
10 and if they're available, then we can match.

11 Q. So let's -- you do, at times, do matching, based on
12 what a client needs and is presenting, and what a
13 counselor's interested in getting experience based on?

14 A. No. It mostly has to do with population base, child,
15 adolescent, adult.

16 Q. So -- but your testimony, I believe, was that if, say,
17 there's a child client and there's a student and
18 counselor who wants some experience counseling a
19 child, that you would attempt to match those, the
20 client with that counselor, so that they could gain
21 that experience?

22 A. The difference in languaging (sic) is, that's a
23 population issue. In other words, somebody wants
24 experience with a child, not a particular demographic,
25 in the sense of depression, anxiety, a particular

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 45

1 diagnosis.

2 Q. So you do population matching, but not diagnosis
3 matching?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. So if a student said, I have struggled and would like
6 to increase my skill set when it comes to people
7 presenting with the issue of depression, you'd make no
8 attempt to get that particular student counselor
9 individuals who are presenting with the issue of
10 depression?

11 A. Generally, no.

12 Q. But you potentially would, or you just would not?

13 A. If the occasion arose and we were able to, but that's,
14 again, happenstance.

15 Q. Can you think of any circumstances, specific
16 circumstances, where you have matched a client with a
17 counselor for a particular reason?

18 A. Other than, say, child, adolescent, and adult, I
19 cannot recall an occasion at this time.

20 Q. Can you think of any situation where you avoided
21 assigning a particular client to a particular
22 counselor, for any particular reason?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Okay. Can you tell me about those situations?

25 MR. GREDEN: And just to clarify, please

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 46

1 don't reveal any student names or client names.

2 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

3 A. A client, or a counselor, who had just suffered the
4 loss of a significant person in their life, and a
5 client who had a -- was coming in to deal with grief
6 issues. So, in that particular case, we thought it
7 better not to do that.

8 BY MR. TEDESCO:

9 Q. Okay. Were there any other -- are there any other
10 situations?

11 A. I cannot think of any others. Generally. In
12 practicum, and this is not an intentional thing, you
13 get the clients you need, not the clients you want.

14 Q. What do you mean by that?

15 A. You get the clients who present to you issues that
16 help you stretch and learn and grow, not the clients
17 that you can softball.

18 Q. So does that -- is there -- is there an intentional --
19 let me restate the question.

20 In the process of assigning clients to
21 student counselors, do you or your staff actively seek
22 to assign a client to a counselor, because you know
23 that counselor needs to be stretched on a particular
24 issue?

25 A. No, it all happens by happenstance.

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 47

1 Q. Okay. Have you ever done that in your --
2 recollection? Have you ever had a situation where you
3 thought, this particular counselor could probably
4 benefit from having this client assigned to them,
5 because it will stretch some -- some boundary issues,
6 or something that they're struggling with?

7 A. No.

8 MR. TADESCO: At this point, I'm going to
9 pull these exhibits that we're going to classify the
10 deposition into different categories, so...

11 * * *

12 BY MR. TEDESCO:

13 Q. Back to Exhibit 1, Leigh, if you could hand that over.

14 A. You know, I want to address something. It's an
15 interesting question that you ask -- that, at times, a
16 client may not like your style, and it just has to do
17 with style, tone of voice, who you are, that they may
18 want a more directive style, or a less directive
19 style.

20 That has more to do with style, and that's
21 what I mean when I say, you don't get along with all
22 clients, and all clients don't get along with you. It
23 doesn't go towards direction of a values issue,
24 because that's not an issue that you bring up. You --
25 you are the blank slate for the client to bounce

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 54

1 counselor who is seeing that person to try and become
2 aware of and deal with those issues in an appropriate
3 and therapeutic way, not just for the client, but for
4 the counselor.

5 Q. But if the counselor comes to the conclusion that, I
6 think -- not out of animosity towards the client--

7 A. Mm-hmm.

8 Q. --but because they want to be as helpful as they can
9 be to the client, that those values situation is not
10 -- is going to potentially negatively impact the
11 session, is it okay for them to refer the client to
12 someone else, at that point, after going through
13 supervision, education, and things like that?

14 A. I would, then, suggest that they continue to receive
15 additional supervision and, in fact, might consult
16 with or have a colleague monitor their work, to ensure
17 that that doesn't happen. And, that if that does
18 leak, that they can become aware of it and deal with
19 it.

20 Q. If the counselor believes that that's just not going
21 to be possible, what's their -- what's their option?

22 A. I'm not sure there is an option.

23 Q. You either continue as a professional counselor or you
24 don't?

25 A. If there are issues that are so paramount to you that

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 55

1 you cannot suspend them, bracket them off so that you
2 can be fully present with someone in their pain, then
3 I would suggest that you may not be appropriate for
4 the profession at this time.

5 Q. Let's -- let's go to Exhibit 1 now.

6 MR. TEDESCO: Leigh, are you going to be
7 asking some questions, as well?

8 MR. GREDEN: I will, but not that many.

9 MR. TEDESCO: Okay.

10 BY MR. TEDESCO:

Q. If you could turn with me, Dr. Francis, in Exhibit 1, to page 59. The provision C5, Nondiscrimination, I'm just going to read that into the record. It says, "Counselors do not condone or engage in discrimination based on age, culture, disability, ethnicity, race, religion/spirituality, gender, gender identity, sexual orientation, marital status/partnership, language preference, socioeconomic status, or any basis prescribed by law. Counselors do not discriminate against clients, students, employees, supervisees, or research participants in a manner that has a negative impact on those persons."

23 I just want to ask you a series of
24 questions, a series of questions about this provision.
25 First of all, the provision states that counselors

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 56

1 cannot condone any of these forms of discrimination.

2 What does condone mean, within the context of this
3 provision?

4 A. To agree and/or promote.

5 Q. Can you give me an example of improper condoning of
6 discrimination?

7 A. That I would believe that persons involved in an
8 interracial marriage to be improper, immoral, and
9 contrary to the human condition.

10 Q. So if you believe that, that's an improper condoning
11 of discrimination under this policy?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Is there anywhere within Eastern Michigan-- I'm sorry,
14 restate the question.

15 Is there anywhere within the Counseling
16 Student Handbook that the term, condone, is defined
17 within the context of this policy?

18 A. Not that I'm aware of.

19 Q. Are there any other EMU documents or policies that
20 define what condone means?

21 A. Not that I'm aware of.

22 Q. How about the term, culture? What does culture mean
23 within the context of this policy?

24 A. Culture are those values, practices, opinions of a
25 group of people that help define them and their

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 57

1 actions and behaviors.

2 Q. Is there anywhere in the Eastern Michigan University
3 Counseling Student Handbook where culture is defined?

4 A. Not that I'm aware of.

5 Q. Is it defined in any other EMU documents or policies?

6 A. It is discussed at length in Counseling 571, Cross-
7 Cultural Counseling.

8 Q. Anywhere else you can think of?

9 A. It may be mentioned in other classes, as it arises.

10 Q. How about religion, what does religion mean within the
11 context of this policy?

12 A. Religion is a set of beliefs, in most cases, an
13 organized set of beliefs, adhered to and practiced by
14 a group or groups of people.

15 Q. What's the difference between religion and
16 spirituality?

17 A. Religion is a set of beliefs, practices, that are
18 organized and adhered to by a particular group of
19 people, whereas spirituality, in many cases, has to do
20 with how one practices their belief system in a
21 personal way, that may not have to do with any
22 particular organized religion, and deals with their
23 actions in how it is reflected with either their
24 relationship with a higher power or some identified
25 system of behaving.

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 58

1 Q. Is there anywhere within the counseling student
2 handbook where those definitions you gave of religion
3 and spirituality are specified?

4 A. Not that I'm aware of.

5 Q. Is there anywhere else, within EMU documents or
6 policies, where these terms are defined?

7 A. This would have been covered, in one way or another,
8 in Counseling 571, the cultural counseling,
9 inter-cultural counseling course. There are no other
10 places that I'm aware of, within the documents and
11 policies.

12 Q. How about gender identity? What does it mean, within
13 the context of this policy?

14 A. Gender identity is how a person perceives and
15 expresses their gender.

16 Q. What falls under -- what genders are protected by
17 this -- by this provision, and by this term, gender
18 identity?

19 A. Would be people who express themselves, male, female,
20 androgenous, nongender, transgendered.

21 Q. Does the counseling student handbook define gender
22 identity anywhere?

23 A. Not that I'm aware of.

24 Q. How about any other EMU documents or policies? Do
25 they define gender identity anywhere?

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 59

1 A. Not that I'm aware of.

2 Q. Sexual orientation is also included in the policy.

3 Can you define what sexual orientation means for me?

4 A. Sexual orientation is an expression of one's gender,
5 in the sense of how I practice or perceive my
6 sexuality -- either as heterosexual, homosexual, or
7 neither.

8 Q. What is neither?

9 A. Someone who is -- does not view themselves as
10 attracted to either gender, even have, you know,
11 bisexual, heterosexual, homosexual, and "I'm not
12 attracted to anybody."

13 Q. Okay. I had not heard of that.

14 A. I actually had a client like that.

15 Q. Okay. Does the counseling student handbook provide a
16 definition anywhere of sexual orientation?

17 A. Not that I'm aware of.

18 Q. Do any other EMU documents or policies define what
19 sexual orientation means?

20 A. These are all issues that are brought up and covered
21 in various classes, more specifically in the Cross
22 Cultural Counseling Course, Counseling 571. I do not
23 know of it in any other policy or procedure.

24 Q. Can you tell me what marital status means, within the
25 context of this policy?

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 60

1 A. Marital status, married, unmarried, divorced, single,
2 separated.

3 Q. Anything else?

4 A. I'm sure there are, but I couldn't name every one of
5 them. I'm sure that might deal with cultural issues.

6 Q. Okay. In what way would that deal with cultural
7 issues?

8 A. How a particular culture views marital status.

9 Q. Is polygamy a marital status?

10 A. In Arizona City.

11 Q. Is it one -- polygamy protected by this prohibition on
12 marital status discrimination?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. How about -- well, can you define for me what a
15 polyamorous relationship is?

16 A. Polyamorous would then be, as the word states, many
17 loves, having or seeking the love from several people.

18 Q. Would it be protected by this provision?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. What's the difference between marital status and
21 marital partnership?

22 A. Whereas a marital partnership, it may be a
23 relationship that, say, mimics marriage in the sense
24 that you have two people who've agreed to come
25 together and operate as a couple; or, to take it to

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 61

1 the extreme that you were taking it, as a team, and
2 may not have the legal aspects of marriage, as defined
3 by the State.

4 Q. Are the terms marital status and marital partnership
5 defined anywhere in the counseling student handbook?

6 A. Not that I'm aware of.

7 Q. Are they defined anywhere else in Eastern Michigan
8 University documents or policies?

9 A. Not that I'm aware of.

10 Q. How about language preference, what does that mean
11 within the context of the policy?

12 A. We are becoming a much more diverse culture. And as
13 our culture becomes more diverse, there are more and
14 more people whose primary language is something other
15 than English, or American, depending on which side of
16 the pond you're on. And so, a client may come in with
17 a language preference for something other than
18 English. We do not discriminate and force somebody to
19 talk in a language that they are uncomfortable with,
20 with us, and would interfere with our ability to
21 provide services.

22 Q. Can you give me an example of a language preference
23 discrimination?

24 A. In a school counseling situation, where a student who
25 would come in who may be new to the United States and

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 62

1 speaks only, say, a language other than English --
2 let's pick one that's easy, Spanish. And I, as the
3 counselor, do not speak Spanish. If I were to try and
4 force the client only to speak English to me, that
5 would be discriminatory. I'm under obligation to see
6 if I can either find a person to translate for me, in
7 making sure that that person understands the bounds of
8 the counseling relationship, so that they -- I can
9 communicate with that person, that's my
10 responsibility. It would be discriminatory to force
11 them to speak in a language that they may not
12 understand.

13 Q. What if an interpreter was unavailable, you couldn't
14 find somebody to do it, could you reassign that
15 client, refer that client to someone who can speak
16 Spanish and provide the service that the client needs?

17 A. If I'm unable to communicate with the client at all,
18 and there's nobody available except another counselor,
19 that would be a case where I might refer them. It
20 would be discriminatory to only provide them English
21 if another counselor is available, in this narrow
22 circumstance, that nobody else is available to provide
23 translation services.

24 Q. Is there anywhere within the Counseling Student
25 Handbook where a definition of Language Preference

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 65

1 But not to abandon the client.

2 If you-- for example, I'll give you a very
3 good example, it's called the "small town problem."
4 You're the only counselor available within a hundred-
5 mile radius, the client has no car, there's nobody
6 else to provide service, then you need to do the best
7 you can to provide the appropriate services to help
8 them. It may be to wait-list them, if their issues
9 are not life-threatening, that they cannot be delayed
10 until you have an opening where you can provide
11 services, then you wait-list them, and then provide
12 the service.

13 Q. Just so I can understand your answer, would it be okay
14 -- if alternative sources were available, alternative
15 counselors were available -- for the counselor who
16 couldn't accommodate that client who was unable to pay
17 for the services, to that other counselor who was able
18 to accommodate that client?

19 A. That is a practice that happens; and, in fact, it's
20 how oftentimes we get clients at our clinic.

21 Q. If you could turn to page 47 of Exhibit 1, Provision
22 A4B, titled "Personal Values"?

23 A. Mm-hmm.

24 Q. And I'll just read that into the record. It says:
25 "Counselors are aware of their own values, attitudes,

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 66

1 beliefs, and behaviors, and avoid imposing values that
2 are inconsistent with counseling goals. Counselors
3 respect the diversity of clients, trainees, and
4 research participants."

5 Can you tell me what "imposing" means,
6 within the context of this policy?

7 A. It would be -- it could be seen in different ways, by
8 imposing what you believe to be the appropriate goals
9 for the client; based on your value system of what you
10 think the client should do. It could be based on
11 imposing your particular views about how a client
12 should behave, act, be perceived, within your value
13 system.

14 Q. Is imposing values something that occurs within the
15 context of the counseling session?

16 A. I'm not following your question -- at the --

17 Q. Can you run afoul of this provision, only when you're
18 in the counseling session with the client, one-on-one?
19 Is that when the imposing values can occur and be
20 improper?

21 A. The counseling relationship begins from the moment the
22 client makes a phone call to you, so imposing values
23 or not imposing values begins from the moment the
24 client calls. It begins, if you are assigned a client
25 and you're reading their case notes, or reading their

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 67

1 referral photos. We read those, not based on our
2 values, but based on what is in the best interests of
3 the client. So, does it take place only in the
4 context of when the person's in front of me? No, it
5 can take place before I even see the client, by making
6 judgments about them based upon what I might hear --
7 if a client calls and has a thick accent, and my
8 values are, "all immigrants should be sent back to
9 where they came from."

10 Q. Okay. How about -- I'm sorry, let me restate the
11 question.

12 Okay, the policy says that you are not to
13 impose your values when they are inconsistent with
14 counseling goals.

15 A. The ethics say that.

16 Q. The ethics code says that.

17 A. Mm-hmm.

18 Q. Is it permissible then, under this policy, to impose
19 your values when they are consistent with counseling
20 goals that the client sets?

21 A. That would also be imposing values. Whether they
22 agree with the client or not, my values are not -- are
23 not what the session is about. It's working within
24 the values of my client. So, I try and suspend or
25 bracket off what I have, to be fully aware and present

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 68

1 with what the client brings in.

2 Q. The ethics code states, that you can't impose the
3 values when they're inconsistent with counseling
4 goals. Why doesn't it just say you can't impose
5 values, if it's true that you can never impose values?

6 A. You'd have to ask the people who wrote this.

7 Q. Your understanding of this policy is that there's no
8 time when you could impose your values, even if
9 they're consistent with counseling goals set by the
10 client?

11 A. There are the normal exceptions of saving a client's
12 life; saving someone else's life who the client may
13 seek to harm; but, beyond that, whether I agree with,
14 or don't agree with the client, becomes secondary to
15 what the client is bringing in to me, and what they're
16 struggling with. I may agree with a client, and if I
17 -- for some reason -- reveal my values, that may then
18 imply to the client that other things that they're
19 doing, I'm in agreement with, when I might not. And
20 that would then interfere with the counseling
21 relationship and cause the client to make assumptions
22 that were incorrect.

23 Q. Is there ever a situation where, rather than imposing
24 your values, you share your values with the client,
25 where you think that it may be helpful to them,

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 71

1 beliefs or practices that would not -- that cause harm
2 to people, that shouldn't be accorded the respect
3 under this policy?

4 A. Not that I can think of, off the top of my head.

5 Q. Other than the couple that you've just referenced?

6 We're going to turn to Exhibit 2 now. And
7 Dr. Francis, this is the ACA ethics opinion regarding
8 conversion or reparative therapy? Are you familiar
9 with this opinion?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And how did you become familiar with it?

12 A. It is one that I read about, and in fact, read this
13 morning, again.

14 Q. Okay. And have you ever provided this ethics opinion
15 to students in your classes?

16 A. No.

17 Q. Have you ever discussed it with students?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And what was the -- what class do you do that in?

20 A. It would have been discussed in any number of classes,
21 specifically, ethical and legal issues and
22 professional issues and counseling -- college
23 counseling as well as discussing -- discussing
24 nondiscriminatory practices within the counseling
25 profession, in a course that we no longer teach that

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 72

1 has been subsumed into-- it's a professional
2 orientation course. It has been subsumed into
3 Counseling 505.

4 Q. And why did you -- why did you determine that you
5 should hand this out to students and discuss it in
6 class?

7 A. I didn't say I handed this out.

8 Q. Oh, that was my question, did you provide to
9 students-- oh, I'm sorry, you said you discussed it.

10 A. Mm-hmm.

11 Q. Why did you determine that you should discuss it with
12 students?

13 A. In the broader sense, it begins to deal with how we,
14 as counselors, our professional orientation is to
15 provide a nonjudgmental stance, and also to talk about
16 that reparative and conversion therapy has no basis,
17 currently, in science, and that the ACA, APA, and any
18 other number of professional mental health
19 associations have stated that reparative or conversion
20 therapy is inappropriate for a science -- let me put
21 it in a different way. It has not been proven to be
22 effective through scientific, rigorous scientific
23 study.

24 Q. Can you define for me what reparative therapy is?

25 A. Reparative and/or conversion therapy is therapy that

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 73

1 would move a client from the current sexuality that
2 they believe that they have, to one that they may
3 perceive that they need to have, according to society
4 or a particular religious belief.

5 Q. On page 4 of this exhibit, point No. 5, it states that
6 there are -- and I'm quoting the opinion now. It
7 says, "There are treatments endorsed by the
8 Association for Gay, Lesbian and Bisexual Issues in
9 Counseling, a division of the American Counseling
10 Association, and the American Psychological
11 Association, that have been successful in helping
12 clients with their sexual orientation. These
13 treatments are gay-affirmative, and help a client
14 reconcile his/her same sex attractions with religious
15 beliefs."

16 Can you tell me what "gay-affirmative
17 treatments" are?

18 A. These would be treatments that do not provide
19 judgment, that if someone is homosexual, that they're
20 bad or deviant, mentally ill, or have a pathology.

21 Q. And where it states that, "These gay-affirmative
22 treatments help a client reconcile his/her same-sex
23 attractions with religious beliefs," how do these gay
24 affirmative treatment protocols assist clients in
25 doing that?

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 74

1 A. It would be to help the client come to terms with what
2 their particular religious belief might be, and what
3 their particular sexual orientation might be, and help
4 them struggle, wrestle, come to terms with how to
5 bring those two together, or if they cannot bring
6 those two together, how to live without that -- that
7 bringing those two together, in a way that may be more
8 helpful or healthful for them.

9 Q. Under gay-affirmative approach to therapy, if you had
10 a client who stated that they were homosexual, but
11 also stated to you that they came from a religious
12 background in training, that taught that it was
13 immoral to be homosexual or engage in homosexual
14 relationships or behavior, would it be consistent with
15 gay affirmative therapy to help that client embrace
16 their religious beliefs and reject change their
17 homosexual orientation?

18 A. I believe it would be appropriate to help the client
19 deal with those goals that they bring forth into
20 counseling. What you're stating is the counselor's
21 agenda. I'm asking, is it the client's agenda?

22 Q. My question then, to clarify, is what if the client's
23 goal, ultimately, is to embrace their religious values
24 that teach that homosexual orientations, behaviors are
25 immoral, and to ultimately change their -- their

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 84

1 referrals to gay-affirmative counselors, should they
2 need to make a referral beyond that.

3 Q. I'm -- the counselor would have to provide the parents
4 with the names of gay-affirmative counselors, as well?

5 A. Well, let's see what it says in here.

6 Q. Please.

7 A. Page 5, second paragraph: "There's also agreement
8 among the committee members that any counselor stating
9 that they can offer conversion therapy must also offer
10 referrals to gay, lesbian, and bisexual affirmative
11 counselors, and should discuss thoroughly the rights
12 of the clients to seek professional
13 counsel -- the professional's counsel."

14 Q. Well, that sentence seems to assume that there are
15 some professional counselors that provide conversion
16 therapy, correct?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. And so, if you were the counselor that we just
19 discussed, in that situation that I presented to you,
20 and the counselor -- well, you said the counselor
21 would have to discuss the scientific evidence
22 regarding reparative therapy, and then provide an
23 appropriate resource for those people to maybe go and
24 get the help they want --

25 A. Well --

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 85

1 Q. And also to provide them with gay-affirmative
2 counselors' names?

3 A. The person that is providing the conversion therapy
4 needs to be able to also provide referrals, as it
5 states here, to people who are gay, lesbian,
6 bisexualy-affirmative counselors. In other words,
7 part of the things that I would then educate the
8 parents on is, one, I can't provide the service; two,
9 these are the things that you need to be aware of when
10 working with someone who does provide these services,
11 you know, they must be able to state to you that this
12 is unproven, that, you know, what are the limitations,
13 what are the benefits, what are the -- what has
14 research shown this to do and not do? That, should
15 this not be the way you want to go, here are the names
16 of people who can provide affirmative counseling for
17 your son or daughter.

18 Q. Okay.

19 A. So that I'm giving them the education that they need,
20 and in a sense, a consumer protection advocate, saying
21 to them, "here are the things that you need to be
22 looking for in this particular case." Let's say you
23 want to go get LASIKs (sic).

24 Q. Get what?

25 A. LASIKs.

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 86

1 Q. Eye surgery?

2 A. Eye surgery. Wouldn't you want the person who
3 provides that for you, or recommends that to you, that
4 these are the things you need to be looking for in a
5 good LASIK surgeon.

6 Q. Are you asking me questions in my deposition?

7 A. Yes, I'm asking you questions in your deposition.

8 Q. I refuse to answer. I advise myself not to answer.

9 MR. GREDEN: Very good.

10 THE WITNESS: Isn't it true that the
11 attorney who takes himself as a client has a fool
12 for -- never mind.

13 MR. TEDESCO: Attorney jokes? Your
14 attorney's sitting right next to you.

15 BY MR. TEDESCO:

16 Q. Just a couple more questions I want to ask you about.
17 And this is in relation to the formal -- your
18 participation in the formal review committee hearing,
19 regarding Julea Ward's case.

20 A. Thank you.

21 Q. Prior to that hearing, other than your involvement
22 with what happened in the counseling clinic --

23 A. Mm-hmm.

24 Q. -- with Julea, and Dr. Callaway --

25 A. Mm-hmm.

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 90

1 you know, and I'd say, "I really can't talk about it,"
2 I don't -- I do not recall. If you have something to
3 show me, please.

4 Q. I don't. Just asking.

5 A. Yeah.

6 Q. Do you -- are you aware that Julea appealed the
7 decision to Dean Polite?

8 A. Yes, we got a copy of his letter.

9 Q. Okay, in between the time that Dr. Ametrano sent the
10 letter, informing Julea of her dismissal, and the
11 ultimate resolution of the appeal by Dean Polite, did
12 you have communications with anybody about the
13 situation, e-mail, telephone, direct conversations?

14 A. Other than appropriate staff, Shannon, you know, who
15 may be, you know, what's happening, oh, you know, not
16 really able to discuss it, not that I recall.

17 O. Would you tell them any details about the situation?

18 A. No. Not allowed to.

19 Q. Okay. Give me a minute just to make sure I've covered
20 everything I want to cover.

21 MR. GREDEN: Let's go off the record for a
22 minute.

(Off the record at 5:08 p.m.)

(Recess taken at 5:09 p.m.)

(On the record at 5:31 p.m.)



PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 91

1 BY MR. TEDESCO:

2 Q. The final questions that we were talking about, right
3 before we took a break, I want to -- I'm -- I want to
4 make sure I understand your answer. If a counselor is
5 in a situation where their clients are -- the clients
6 are parents of a minor child, who recently told them
7 that she's a lesbian and has come out to them, and the
8 clients say, "We're here because we're deeply
9 religious people, we think that this is immoral, that
10 the behavior's immoral, that the -- thinking that
11 you're a lesbian is immoral and wrong, we want you to
12 help us help our daughter not be a lesbian, and not
13 engage in --

14 A. Mm-hmm.

15 Q. -- homosexual behaviors and relationships, the
16 counselor, in that setting, does what? Do they
17 provide an appropriate referral to a counselor who
18 does reparative therapy, or do they not provide a
19 referral at all?

20 A. The counselor sits down. First, you want to, at the
21 very least, empathize with their position, where
22 they're at -- that this is a shocking situation,
23 possibly, for them, or whatever they're feeling at
24 that time. And then, to discuss with them, you know,
25 again, you know -- not reaffirm, is not the word I'm

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 92

1 looking for, but to reconfirm what their goal is, to
2 educate them concerning, you know, what is sexual
3 development, how does it occur, and to talk about what
4 we know from a science point of view, you know, what's
5 going on here, and then to go on to talk about, you
6 know, reparative therapy -- that it is not considered
7 a standard of care that is supported by the mental
8 health profession. And that, one, I do not provide
9 that kind of care, it's just not within my skill set,
10 nor is it something I've learned. Secondly, that I
11 would then talk to them about, if you -- you know, if
12 you choose to continue-- you know, I can't see you,
13 because I don't provide that kind of care, that's not
14 the standard of care within the profession.

15 Q. Okay.

16 A. Secondly, to talk about, these are the things that you
17 should expect from somebody who does provide that
18 therapy, and talk about what they should be looking
19 for.

20 And then, to point them in the appropriate
21 direction to find a referral. I don't have a
22 referral. I don't know of anyone who provides that
23 service, and I don't know of any counselors right now,
24 in my professional contacts, that know of anybody that
25 provides that service. But I would point them in the

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 93

1 direction of where they might find that, which could
2 be through an American Association of Christian
3 Counselors, AACC. I don't know if the Counseling and
4 Psycholog -- or, Christian Association of
5 Psychological Studies provides that type of referral
6 service. I don't think so -- they've always struck me
7 as not supporting reparative therapy. So, you know,
8 point them in the direction of where they can find
9 resources.

10 Q. Okay. Just a couple more questions. You mentioned
11 two professors that you had talked to, in between the
12 informal review conference and the formal review
13 hearing, regarding Julea Ward's case.

14 A. I talked to two professors between when I was notified
15 there would be a formal review, and before the formal
16 review concert.

17 Q. Okay, and that notification occurred after the
18 informal review conference occurred?

19 A. Correct.

20 Q. Okay. Did you -- what did you speak to them about,
21 specifically?

22 A. The issue, as presented to me. Here -- here are the
23 facts as I know them. What are your thoughts about
24 this?

25 Q. Okay. And where did you get the facts from, that you

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 94

1 were explaining to them?

2 A. The facts, as I knew them, in the sense that, here we
3 have a student who said, you know, from what I was
4 exposed to down at the clinic, you know, here I have a
5 student who was-- refused to see this particular
6 client. The fact that, right after the informal
7 review, I happened to be upstairs. My office is on
8 the first floor, the department office and where my
9 other office is is on the third floor, and I was
10 upstairs when Dr. Callaway came out of the clinic, or
11 came out of the conference room and said that Julea
12 Ward's being suspended from practicum, and at that
13 point, I had a good idea of what was going on, based
14 on what had happened previously.

15 Q. Okay. Sorry?

16 A. Getting your addiction.

17 Q. Yeah, tell me about it.

18 When you spoke to Dr. Callaway, as you
19 said, upstairs, what -- what was -- what else was
20 discussed, if anything?

21 A. That was it. Because she was going to come downstairs
22 and get Julea's tapes and any files that she might
23 have, and anything she might have down in the clinic.
24 And I said, don't worry about that, I'll take her
25 downstairs, and I'll do that.

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 102

1 A. No. God no, that would be -- that would be thought
2 control.

3 Q. You testified earlier today, under examination by Mr.
4 Tedesco, that a single incident of bad rapport with a
5 client does not necessarily -- demonstrate that a
6 counselor has a skill deficiency; is that a fair
7 representation of your testimony?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. How do you distinguish between that situation, where a
10 counselor-in-training may have a single incident of
11 bad rapport, versus what you saw regarding Mrs. Ward's
12 behavior?

13 A. A single incident of bad rapport can be remediated
14 with simple supervision, dealing with skills, or
15 administratively a simple, you know, you need to call
16 the client and make sure you have everything ready
17 when the client comes in. That's easily remedied by
18 modifying behaviors. Julea Ward was not willing to
19 modify her behavior, and her behavior was one that was
20 pervasive over an entire class of people or people's,
21 dealing with particular issues that could be
22 considered -- that particular classes of people, whom
23 she was discriminating against.

24 Q. You testified earlier today about Exhibit 1, page 59,
25 section C5.

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 103

1 A. Mm-hmm.

2 Q. Do you recall that testimony?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. I believe you were asked by Mr. Tedesco, how do you
5 define the word "condone." And I believe you
6 testified, agreed or promote; is that an accurate
7 representation of your testimony?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. You had started to provide an example of how you
10 thought someone could condone discrimination, and I
11 don't know if you were able to answer your question,
12 so I wanted to give you that opportunity. The example
13 you used was interracial marriage, and I just want you
14 to try and finish your -- your answer. Do you recall
15 that testimony, or do you --

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Okay, how -- could you provide us the example you were
18 thinking of, about how someone could condone
19 discrimination, based on interracial marriage, in a
20 way that would violate section C5 of the Code of
21 Ethics?

22 A. Condone is to -- as I believe I've said, was to
23 promote and/or support behaviors or ways of providing
24 counseling that are discriminatory against a class of
25 people, or a different type of people. That does not

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 104

1 mean that a counselor cannot believe what they want to
2 believe. Counselors believe all sorts of things.
3 We're a very varied profession within all the mental
4 health professions. But to promote and/or actively
5 practice behaviors that discriminate against a class
6 of people is inappropriate, and violates these
7 particular ethics codes. You're not providing
8 appropriate clinical care to that class of people.

9 Q. You also testified earlier, under examination by Mr.
10 Tedesco, that self-disclosure by a counselor,
11 regarding the counselor's views or experiences, should
12 be limited. And an example you provided was when a
13 counselor has faced a similar situation. Is that an
14 accurate summary of your testimony?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Are there times when such self-disclosure by a
17 counselor could be harmful to a client?

18 A. Very much so.

19 Q. Could you give an example?

20 A. Let's use that same example and say, for example, a
21 client was coming in to deal with their -- the
22 ramifications of a divorce in their life. And let's
23 say the counselor, for whatever reason, had also gone
24 through a similar experience. The counselor, using
25 self-disclosure, might then begin to talk about their

PERRY CLARK FRANCIS

December 17, 2009

Page 108

1 CERTIFICATE OF NOTARY

2 STATE OF MICHIGAN)

3) SS

4 COUNTY OF MONROE)

5

6 I, LEISA PASTOR, certify that this
7 deposition was taken before me on the date
8 hereinbefore set forth; that the foregoing questions
9 and answers were recorded by me, stenographically, and
10 reduced to computer transcription; that this is a
11 true, full and correct transcript of my stenographic
12 notes so taken; and that I am not related to, nor of
13 counsel to either party, nor interested in the event
14 of this cause.

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22 LEISA PASTOR, CSR-3500, CRR,

23 Notary Public,

24 Monroe County, Michigan

25 My Commission expires: 9/7/13